

Comments for Planning Application 18/00452/LBC

Application Summary

Application Number: 18/00452/LBC

Address: 48A Marygate York YO30 7BH

Proposal: Erection of two storey dwelling following demolition of existing garage block with detached outbuilding forming studio to rear

Case Officer: Elizabeth Potter

Customer Details

Name: Dr David Fraser

Address: Fairfax House, 27 Castlegate, York YO1 9RN

Comment Details

Commenter Type: Consultee response

Stance: Customer objects to the Planning Application

Comment Reasons:

Comment: The Planning Committee of York Civic Trust considered this application at its meeting on 10 May 2018.

The Trust objects to the proposal for the following reasons:

- Ill-suited in design, form and prominence for this historic area
- Detrimental to the Conservation Area
- Loss of trees and historic green space

Ill-suited in design, form and prominence

The plot site for 48a Marygate is situated in the grounds of St Olave's House, 48 Marygate - a Grade II listed C17 dwelling with a c.1900 frontage - and beside 44-46 Marygate, Grade II listed C19 residences. Opposite the site, on raised land, is Grade I listed St Olave's Church, which dates from the C15. The site is also in the city's Historic Core Conservation Area, from which Marygate has its own Conservation Character Area.

This is therefore a historic and aesthetic location, where any new development requires sensitivity. To this end, the Trust is not convinced that such a new building should be 'inspired by the current contemporary vernacular', as suggested in the Design and Access Statement. The justification made in the Design and Access Statement that this proposed C21 aesthetic is in keeping with other modern design in the area (a pair of dwellings approved at 52 Marygate and Summerhouse Mews which backs on to this site) is undermined by neither example being prominently seen from

Marygate. In contrast, the proposal, would be too prominent at the front of the site, visible in relation to the Grade II flanking properties and the Grade I church opposite, and interrupt the continuity of the street in terms of height, massing, depth and use of materials. Indeed, as evident in the response from the Guildhall Planning Panel, 48a might well be considered an unsympathetic extension to 44-46 Marygate, rather than a detached building.

Detrimental to the Conservation Area

The Trust is not convinced by the justification for such a prominently C21 design and use of materials (including anthracite zinc shingles) due to 'there [being] neither a vernacular or a palette common to this Conservation area' (Heritage Statement). With the exception of the Bay Horse public house, the vernacular of this residential side of Marygate is universally: brick, sash windows, symmetrical fenestration and pitched roofs of slate or tile. The proposed design does not conform to any of these vernacular features and is therefore ill-suited due to being over-assertive and not befitting the local vernacular of Marygate. It is therefore detrimental to the Conservation Area and its character.

Loss of trees and historic green space

The proposal makes reference to the loss of two mature trees in the garden of No.48 Marygate (with another one shown as removed on the proposed plans). York Civic Trust would not support the loss of these trees, believing that green space, including private gardens of longstanding, are an important aspect of Marygate and have been incrementally lost in recent decades due to garden development.

It is for these reasons that York Civic Trust objects to this proposal.